

**Publikumsfragen im Anschluss an den Vortrag von Emilia Roig am 5. Juli 2024**

Die folgenden Fragen wurden mittels eines Online-Tools vom Publikum vor Ort und den Zuhörenden im Livestream gestellt. Aus Zeitgründen konnten nur einige Fragen gestellt werden, manche wurden gebündelt, andere mussten offenbleiben.

- Thanks for the wonderful lecture. I couldnt entirely understand example of turkey. their statement is anti israel even inviting hamas leader to turkey. They "need" to put statement against israel since it is a overly populated muslim country and cutting trades about 50 goods but recent news shows that all the goods are sent through Greece so they re not really agaisnt israel.which also happened in before many times turkey out a statement against Israel many times but still turkey is third country doing trades with israel.They re still capitalist. What is your opinion on this?
- Why do you insist on the right to self-determination? Why not support for the safety amd right to reside everywhere instead? What about other groups? What criteria? Do Roma, Catalonian, Kurdish people have this righ too? Shouldnt we rather work on overcoming the idea of nation-states?
- Question: What is the ultimate goal or claim of anti-zionism? (Besides a state/region without discrimination and occupation, which everyone should support, I believe). Specifically: Should Israel exist at all? What is the imagined / wanted goal?
- Thank you for the great, informative talk. It is essential to understand such distinction in current situations.
- Positionality: What does this mean for non-jewish activists? Should they identify as pro-jewish/anti-antisemitic and pro-palestinian anti-imperialists or anti-nationalists or anti-zionists? What would you recommend?
- How would you explain that Non Palestinian Arabs native to the land - Druz, Samaritans, and Beduin, are vehemently supportive of Zionism, serve in the Israeli army, and see Palestinians as the colonizers of the land?
- Is there a concept of white supremacy in Israel even if the society is divers ?
- Correction - Albert Einstein was a zionist. He also said: Long before the emergence of Hitler I made the cause of Zionism mine because through it I saw a means of correcting a flagrant wrong....The Jewish people alone has for centuries been in the anomalous position of being victimized and hounded as a people, though bereft of all the rights and protections which even the smallest people normally has...Zionism offered the means of ending this discrimination. Through the return to the land to which they were bound by close historic ties...

- What is your standing regarding the narrative of Hamas en Houthi as freedom fighters that seems to be widespread in the antizionist moviment? Think about Judith Butler's outings and the last protests in New York outside the Nova festival exhibit.
- After Greek, Roman, Arab, Ottoman and British occupations, the Jews finally came back to their homeland. Isn't that the definition of an anti colonial, anti imperial movement?
- The leaders of what's called doykeit, as you briefly said, were killed. Do you understand that it means they were proved wrong?
- VIELEN VIELEN DANK !
- Why would Le Penn's support of Zionism mean any more than the admittance that there is antisemitism in your movement? Why would it discredit the movement as a whole?
- In what way are we seeing the far right Zionist co-opt this conversation?
- Is Israel a settler-colonial state?
- How could actual solutions for the current situation in Israel / Palestine look like in practice? (No panacea expected)
- Is the Presidium of the university present today? What are their thoughts on today's talk?
- On the good Jew - bad Jew narrative. Do you see that invoked when anti-Zionist Jews speak of „my Jewish values ...“ in debates around Palestine?
- The narrative has been dominated by Zionist as obvious from your own experience and also the far right in Europe. Who are these people? And what do you have to say about Islamophobia.
- What is your view on the BDS movement? Do you consider it anti Semitic?
- Do you have an idea how the antizionism movement can and needs to act against antisemites within their ranks? Just stating that there is Antisemitism in the Antizionism Movement cannot be enough. There needs to be stronger action.
- Do you see a problem in using the IHRA definition and why?
- Just a reminder - the free university was built on the empty villas of Jews murdered in the Holocaust. The audacity to have a one sided talk in such a place, under the guise of a debate with a question mark in the name, without mentioning that is a shame
- Ein unglaublich interessanter und differenzierter Beitrag zur aktuell aufgeheizten Debatte. Was glauben Sie ist das realistischste Szenario für die Zukunft der PalästinenserInnen in Israel/Palästina?
- How can we detect and tackle Antisemitism inside of the Anti-Zionist-Movement?

- What is the reason for the stringent separation of racism and anti-semitism that a lot of people force?
- You mentioned that anti-zionism is not negating Israel's right to exist, and this may be controversial, but seeing as Israel is a very young nation state, about 76 years, wouldn't a re-imagining of the state, possibly a dissolving of the state in order to re-establish a liberated nation for Jewish people and Palestinians be valid? I'm sure many indigenous peoples would have hoped for that chance if they could go back in time.
- Sehen sie sich wirklich repräsentativ für die jüdische Mehrheitsgesellschaft? Sie als sehr privilegierte Jüdin, da Sie Israel als Schutzraum nicht brauchen, frage ich folgendes: wenn 90% aller jüdischen Menschen Zionistisch sind, wieso hören sie nicht diesen betroffenen zu?
- Thanks alot for your presentation. I very much appreciated that you stressed criticism of antisemitism within the anti-Zionist movement should not easily be washed away. However, against the backdrop of the current discourse including smear campaigns, how is it possible to adequately address antisemitism within the movement. How to deal with the contradiction that antisemitism should be publicly discussed, whilst the public discourse does not allow for such a discussion, as - especially in Germany - antisemitism is always linked to the Holocaust and to the dichotomy of good and evil..?
- You mentioned that Anti-Semitism has been going on for thousands of years. Was the racialisation of Jews not something that has its roots in Europe of the 18/19th century? Are we not mixing up Anti-Semitism with Anti-Judaism if we only focus Anti-Semitism and Anti-Zionism.
- As any study Shows that 90 percent and higher of Jews are in fact Zionist, would you agree you're being tokenized by the pro Palestinian movement to show they "have Jews too" and hence aren't antisemitic
- I often hear that conspiracy theories are singular to anti-Semitism versus other forms of oppression. While of course this has been central to anti-semitism, do you agree that it's singular? Because I think there are also a lot of conspiracy elements to anti-Muslim hatred, especially in the last 20 years...
- How can we promote better dialogue between this voices in society (Zionism - anti-zionism)?
- How do you see the relation between Zionism and Colonialism?
- First of all thank you so much! Can you talk a bit deeper about the IHRA definition, its flaws and the danger of the implementation of this definition as a political agenda Also if you have further questions, come to Heba Camp at 1 pm for a Q&A with Emilia
- as you said, antisemitism in the region is very much real. as an Iranian growing up both in Iran and Germany, it has taken me a lifetime to separate Iran's anti-zionism/ Germany's philosemitism from the realities on the ground... how would you equip people to recognize the antisemitism within the anti-zionist movement?

- How could the argument against structural antisemitism be reconciled with countering Zionist tools of influence like AIPAC and other organisations, such as the ones leading the smear campaign against you?
- You said you grew up in a Zionist household. Was there a turning point for you in becoming a non- or anti-Zionist?
- re: "anti-Semites in the anti-Zionist movement are firstly antisemites". What do you think about the idea that all of us absorbed antisemitic ideas due to being raised in this world? That would imply that Antisemitism is more widespread (in the movement and elsewhere) than your comment suggested.
- Arendt also argued that political/ human rights can only be ensured when people have a political entity they belong to. What would be an alternative concept to materialize this political entity for Jewish people if not Israel because history has also shown that Jews were not safe throughout thousands of years?
- How does the delegitimation of "Queers for Palestine" and the pinkwashing on Israel's behalf come into play in this debate?
- Do you think that transitional justice might be the way out ? Learning from the mistakes and dysfunctions of this process in South Africa.
- Resoultion UN 3379, sagt, dass Zionismus ist eine Form von Rassismus. warum wurde diese Resolution 1991 gecancelst?
- You mentioned your Jewish identity. Since identity is an important ressource in the debate, I wonder if you could elaborate on this. Were both of your parents Jewish, did you grow up Jewish, are you part of a Jewish community today? Being an anti-Zionist Jew, how do you interact with the Jewish community in Germany? A poll from 2021 reveiled that only 7 % of German Jews do Israel NOT see as an important part of their Jewish identity. How should we deal with this reality?
- Do you think that the holocaust and western countries' refusal to accept Jewish refugees in the 1930s & 40s made Bundism obsolete, and demonstrated the necessity of Israel as a safe haven for Jews?
- But if the Israelis have the right to stay there: how can the exiled Palestinians get justice? They have been forcefully removed. How can they get their deserved justice? Do the illegal settlers get to keep the stolen land just because they are already there? How can we compensate all the stolen land? And is there really a realistic solution that the Palestinian Arabs (with all the trauma and massacres they have faced) and the Zionist Israelis can live together?
- On a more practical note: the German discourse focusses on the narratives brought forward by groups/organisations speaking for „all Jews“ such as Zentralrat, Jewish Student Union etc which have an explicitly Zionist agenda. How do you view this, how representative are they? How to move forward with this?

- The concept of antizionism actually has a clear historical origin - the Soviet Union rhetoric during the cold war. Many arguments you present are exact replica of Soviet rhetoric, with the USSR being massively antisemitic. Could you react on it?
- How can we tackle antisemitism in the pro-palestinien movement in Germany? During protest at Humboldt-Uni, occupants painted Hamas signs at the walls. And the organizers (student coalition Berlin) didn't distance themselves from the antisemitic incidences afterwards. This delegitimizes the whole movement.
- What about genocide?
- Wie erklären Sie die starke Unterstützung durch den Westen für Israel und Zionismus?
- At demos in Berlin we often hear the Arabic call, "huriya, Falastin Arabia". Do you consider this to be a call for removal of non-Arabs from Palestine or at the least their political disenfranchisement? I am worried that such calls discredit the movement to free Palestine.
- Wenn über importierten Antisemitismus gesprochen wird, müssen wir doch auch darüber reden, dass dieser Antisemitismus zuerst exportiert wurde VON den Deutschen IN die arabischen Länder, um sich mit ihnen gegen die Briten zu verbünden. Diesen Aspekt auszulassen, würde die wahren Ausmaße der Judenverfolgung leugnen.
- I have been accused by several white Germans of believing in conspiracy theories when I've explained Israel's Hannibal doctrine and how a "mass Hannibal" has happened on Oct. 7th according to an air force officer of the IDF, meaning that Israel has killed many of the victims itself via drones, shooting from helicopters etc. I really want this knowledge to spread together with the fact that oppressed ppl have a right to armed resistance and Israel does NOT have a right to defend itself against the people it occupies. What do you say to this?
- How do you handle the cognitive dissonance of white Germans accusing you of antisemitism? What advice would you give to BIPOCs living here who are constantly targeted with this accusation? How can a constructive discussion continue to be possible when this is brought up?"
- Auf welche konkrete Quellen basiert Ihre Definition vom Antizionismus, die eher einer Idealvorstellung zu entsprechen scheint? Warum wurden reale, israelnegierende und holocaustnegierende Positionen und Aussagen im Anti-Zionismus weitgehend ausgeklammert, die keine Minderheitsdiskurse darstellen? Haben Sie eine systematische Diskursanalyse durchgeführt?
- In times where FU Berlin hosts talks that not only are unscientific but also highly reactionary reiterating the most cynical narratives of German tabloid media it's very refreshing to have you speak here today. Thank you for that. While I think it's important what you said here today a worrying trivialization of the public discourse on the middle east conflict can be witnessed. People and scientists like you are making justifications about expressing criticism against Israel despite never having been to Israel. Others are defending themselves against accusations of antisemitism for calling out war crimes committed by Israel. By responding to these tropes are we just engaging in this very same kind of distraction from the actual issue

at the moment which are the outrageous atrocities and violations of human rights and international law that are currently happening?

- Danke Emilia!!!
- How should Israel react to October 7 in your opinion? What is Hamas for you? What is its responsibility for the killing of Palestinian people? Why do you use the word "genocide" while it was legally decided that it is false and that only the Hamas is acting genocidally and promoting a genocide of Israelis and Jews in general? Why are you speaking of a "genocide" and not mention with one word October 7, the genocidal program and actions and founding document of Hamas and that there are still Israelis held hostage? And that there is no evidence that the Israeli government wants to kill all Palestinians because they are Palestinians but that in fact they are warning people, giving them time to flee and transporting food, water, medical stuff into Gaza? And what is the role of Egypt? Why doesn't Egypt help the population of Gaza? Why is there a wall and closed gate instead of help and the opportunity to get refuge?